



PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE

March 23, 2009

The Public Safety Committee of the City of Mesa met in the lower level meeting room of the Council Chambers, 57 East 1st Street, on March 23, 2009 at 3:30 p.m.

COMMITTEE PRESENT

Dennis Kavanaugh, Chairman
Dina Higgins
Scott Somers

COMMITTEE ABSENT

None

STAFF PRESENT

Christopher Brady
Alfred Smith
Trisha Sorensen

Items on the agenda were discussed out of order, but for purposes of clarity will remain as listed on the agenda.

1. Items from citizens present.

There were no items from citizens present.

2. Hear a presentation, discuss and make a recommendation on the Fire Department's automatic external defibrillators program.

Chairman Kavanaugh advised that this item was brought before the Committee at the request of Committeemember Somers.

Assistant Fire Chief Mary Cameli introduced Battalion Chief William Hayes and Fire Inspections Supervisor Randy Sevilla.

Chief Hayes displayed a PowerPoint presentation (a copy is available for review in the City Clerk's Office) and said that automatic external defibrillators (AEDs) are units that deliver a shock to the heart through adhesive electrodes placed on a patient's chest, the purpose of which is to bring the heart back into a normal rhythm. He said that early defibrillation increases the patient's ability to survive and improves the effectiveness of Emergency Medical Services (EMS).

Chief Hayes reported that 465,000 people die from sudden cardiac arrest each year, and he added that AED use with basic Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation (CPR) increases patient survival by 74 percent. He advised that the average cost for one AED with the training and setup is

\$2,000. He noted that additional costs would depend on the number of AED's, the number of personnel to be trained, and the number of batteries, etc. Chief Hayes said that 25 AEDs are currently in place at various public locations throughout the City.

Mr. Sevilla advised that the State Health Department has created regulations governing the use of AEDs.

Committeemember Somers said that while in the Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport, he noticed that no AEDs were in place. He also noted that some City pools and golf courses do not have AEDs.

Discussion ensued relative to the fact that a minimal amount of training is required in order to successfully use an AED; and that the AED has voice prompts to guide the individual in how to operate the machine.

Committeemember Somers suggested that staff craft an ordinance that requires AED's to be placed in airports and other areas of public assembly such as hotels, schools, and in multi-story public buildings.

Further discussion ensued relative to the fact that there are opportunities to alert the faith-based communities regarding these units; that the units could be required for a certain level of building occupancy; that irreversible brain death begins to occur at six minutes; that senior living and retirement facilities should be required to have AEDs; that an ordinance can be retroactive when the issue is a matter of public health; that the City could purchase AEDs in a large quantity and pass the cost savings along to the public facilities; and that maintenance of the AEDs would also have to be addressed.

Chairman Kavanaugh summarized that the consensus of the Committee was that staff be directed to draft an ordinance that requires automatic external defibrillators (AEDs) in public and private buildings where large numbers of people assemble, that options be explored to include a retroactive provision, and that implementation be permitted on a graduated basis.

Chairman Kavanaugh thanked staff for the presentation.

3. Hear a presentation and discuss the Police Department's Civilian Investigation Specialist Pilot Program.

Assistant Police Chief Mike Dvorak addressed the Committee and displayed a PowerPoint presentation (a copy is available for review in the City Clerk's Office) to provide information on the Civilian Investigation Specialist (CIS) Pilot Program. He advised that the Pilot Program in the Superstition Springs substation would utilize trained civilian investigative personnel to handle first-responder types of investigations. Chief Dvorak stated that although a program in England has some similarities, this model would be unique to the United States. He said that the objectives of the Program are to provide high quality crime scene and forensic investigations and exceptional customer service by utilizing trained civilian personnel in place of sworn officers. He explained that sworn personnel would then be more available to respond to incidents and criminal activity where suspects are present. Chief Dvorak advised that eleven Civilian Investigation Specialists have been hired and will be assigned to the Investigations Unit

to provide coverage 24 hours a day, 7 days a week for the following types of low-risk property crimes without suspects on the scene:

- Burglary
- Theft
- Stolen Vehicles
- Criminal Damage
- Found Property
- Fraud

Chief Dvorak stated that following graduation from the Training Academy on April 3rd, the Specialists would begin eight weeks of field training on April 6th followed by solo field deployment on June 1, 2009. He advised that each would drive an unmarked vehicle without emergency lights and that the trunk would be equipped with forensic equipment. Chief Dvorak said that each Specialist would also be provided a camera, digital recorder, radio, phone and laptop computer, and he added that the Specialists would be dressed in professional, civilian attire. He said that a typical day would include making appointments with crime victims, visiting crime scenes and processing evidence, and when completed, providing each customer with a customer service survey.

Chief Dvorak advised that the success of the program would be measured in the following manner:

- Customer surveys regarding the level of service.
- Evaluation of the quality of the investigative and crime scene processing.
- Assessment of the workload effectiveness and efficiency.

Chief Dvorak expressed the hope that the Pilot Program will result in faster response times by sworn officers to citizen calls reporting criminal activity because the officers will not be involved in processing a property crime scene. He said that monthly evaluations would be conducted during the one-year Pilot Program.

Committeemember Somers said he looked forward to seeing the evaluations of the Pilot Program, and he suggested that the Program be nominated for an Innovation in Government award.

Chairman Kavanaugh stated the opinion that this Program is one of the most creative approaches that he has seen with regard to the use of civilian personnel, and he commended the Police Department for developing the Program.

Chief Dvorak stated that the Pilot Program is an attempt to implement a new way of doing business, and he added that the Program should enable the department to place sworn officers in the field where they are needed the most.

Chairman Kavanaugh thanked Chief Dvorak for the presentation.

4. Prescheduled public opinion appearances.

- a. Hear from Bryan Jeffries regarding merit/performance pay for employees.

Bryan Jeffries, President of the Mesa United Firefighters Association, displayed a PowerPoint presentation (a copy is available for review in the City Clerk's Office) and said that he became aware that the City was giving consideration to changing Public Safety employees from a "merit pay" system to a "pay for performance" system. He acknowledged that the current economic crisis has presented City officials with many difficult challenges. Mr. Jeffries requested that both Police and Fire Department employees be given an opportunity to provide their input to management regarding the pay system.

Mr. Jeffries advised that the current merit system requires employees to be reviewed by a supervisor, and he stated that a pay increase is not automatic. He noted that the system is based on performance in that certain job standards must be met. He added that unscheduled merit increases or other rewards are currently suspended because of the budget crisis. Mr. Jeffries expressed concern that the possibility of a future wage freeze would impact individuals in the lower wage categories.

Mr. Jeffries reported that the City rejected the "pay for performance" approach in 1989 after conducting a thorough examination of this type of program. He stated that in reality the "pay for performance" approach reduces the funding available rather than rewarding employees for improved performance. Mr. Jeffries cited the example of an employee with more than twenty years of service who serves as a Captain in the Avondale Fire Department and who has not yet reached the maximum amount of Captain's pay under their "pay for performance" systems. He stated the opinion that the "pay for performance" approach usually results in three types of problems:

1. The halo effect where the employee's character traits (good or bad) can unduly influence the evaluation.
2. Over emphasis on an isolated event (good or bad) that unduly influences the evaluation.
3. The central tendency effect that gives everyone an average evaluation in order to avoid possible conflict or confrontation.

Mr. Jeffries advised that another issue with the "pay for performance" approach is "wage compression," which can result in wide discrepancies as a result of market adjustments, cost of living adjustments and performance increases. He reported that the Town of Gilbert is moving away from the "pay for performance" approach because in one instance, the approach resulted in a Supervisor making far less money than one of his subordinates.

Mr. Jeffries cited comments by various experts regarding problems with the "pay for performance" system, some of which are listed below:

- Linking performance and salaries is a complicated process.
- The work of today's highly skilled workers is more complex and difficult to evaluate.
- Supervisors may have a natural tendency to favor individuals similar to them, which could result in bias towards women or minorities.

- Pay for performance systems are expensive to implement and administer.
- The work environment, feedback from supervisors and recognition are the key elements in employee job satisfaction, and the amount of pay typically accounts for approximately one percent of employee motivation.

Mr. Jeffries noted that an important factor is that "pay for performance" targets individual achievement rather than organizational achievement, which could cause problems for Public Safety employees who rely on a cooperative group effort to accomplish their mission on the street. He expressed the hope that the Council would discuss this important policy issue, and he reiterated his request that employees have an opportunity to provide input. He thanked the Committee for the opportunity to bring this issue to their attention.

5. Adjournment.

Without objection, the Public Safety Committee meeting adjourned at 4:13 p.m.

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the Public Safety Committee meeting of the City of Mesa, Arizona, held on the 23rd day of March 2009. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

LINDA CROCKER, CITY CLERK

baa